



NATIONAL INTEGRITY WORKSHOP

AT ACCRA INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE CENTRE
20 - 21 OCTOBER, 1998

ON THE THEME

**" TOWARDS A COLLECTIVE PLAN OF ACTION FOR THE
CREATION OF A NATIONAL INTEGRITY SYSTEM"**

ORGANISED BY

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS AND ADMINISTRATIVE JUSTICE

OCTOBER, 1998



NATIONAL INTEGRITY WORKSHOP

AT ACCRA INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE CENTRE
20 - 21 OCTOBER, 1998

ON THE THEME

**" TOWARDS A COLLECTIVE PLAN OF ACTION FOR THE
CREATION OF A NATIONAL INTEGRITY SYSTEM"**

ORGANISED BY

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS AND ADMINISTRATIVE JUSTICE

OCTOBER, 1998

Table Of Contents

Acknowledgements

Acronyms and Abbreviations

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

1. Introduction
 - 1.1 Background
 - 1.2 Purpose of the Workshop
 - 1.3 Workshop Structure
 - 1.4 Discussions
 - 1.5 Summary of Major Action Steps
Recommended Action Plan

WORKSHOP PROCEEDINGS

2. Opening Session - Summary of Presentations
 - 2.1 Opening Statement - Mr. Emile Francis SHORT, Commissioner, Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice
 - 2.2 Statement by Mr. Bertrand De SPEVILLE, former Chairman of the Independent Commission Against Corruption, Hong Kong.
 - 2.3 Key Note Address - H.E. John ATTA-MILLS, Vice-President of the Republic of Ghana
 - 2.4 Chairman's Remarks - Nana (Dr.) S.K.B. ASANTE, Chairman, Public Utilities and Regulatory Commission, International Legal Consultant
3. Summary of Plenary Presentations and Discussions
 - First Plenary Session*
 - 3.1 *Corruption and the Human Factor* - Rt. Rev. Charles PALMER-BUCKLE
 - 3.2 *Review of Official Mechanisms for Combating Corruption* - Mr. Yaw ASAMOA and Dr. E. GYIMAH-BOADI.
 - 3.3 *Investigative Journalism: Role and Challenges in Combating Corruption in Ghana* - Mr. William NYARKO
 - Second Plenary Session*
 - 3.4 *Corruption and the Private Sector* - Mr. Kwasi ABEASI
 - 3.5 *The Procurement : A Critique* - Mr. David OFOSU-DORTE
 - 3.6 *The Cost of Corruption in Health and Education Institutions* - Ms. Audrey GADZEKPO and Dr. A. Lamensdorf OFORI-ATTA
 - Third Plenary Session*
 - 3.7 *Combating Corruption Through Institutional Reform* - Mr. Nihal JAYAWIKRAMA, Executive Director, Transparency International
 - 3.8 *Botswana's Approach to Corruption* - Mr. Adolph HIRSCHFELD - Assistant Director, Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime, Botswana

Acronyms and Abbreviations

CDD	Centre for Democracy and Development
CEPS	Customs Excise and Preventive Services
CID	Criminal Investigations Department
CHRAJ	Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice
CPI	Corruption Perception Index
GBA	Ghana Bar Association
GES	Ghana Education Service
GNAT	Ghana National Association of Teachers
GSC	Ghana Supply Commission
IRS	Internal Revenue Service
MOE	Ministry of Education
MOH	Ministry of Health
NCCE	National Commission on Civic Education
NIRP	National Institutional Renewal Programme
NFED	Non-Formal Education Division
PTA	Parent Teacher Association
SFO	Serious Fraud Office
SSS	Senior Secondary School
TI	Transparency International

Executive Summary

Introduction

1.1 Background

The decision to hold a workshop on the theme: “Towards a Collective Plan of Action for the Creation of a National Integrity System”, was taken in the context of increased public recognition of the huge developmental costs of corruption and the need to depoliticize anti-corruption efforts. Building broad-based coalitions of individuals, civil society organisations and public institutions is an important strategy for success in combating corruption.

The Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice (CHRAJ) has served as a focus for Human Rights in Ghana since its establishment in 1993. Within the framework of Ghana’s 1992 constitution, the mandate of CHRAJ includes the constitutional task of promoting public ethics and investigating allegations and complaints of corruption and abuse of office among public servants. Collaboration with key institutions such as the Executive Branch, Parliament, the Judiciary, the Serious Fraud Office, the Attorney General’s office, the Media and Civil Society Organisations is a cornerstone of CHRAJ’s strategy towards effective fulfillment of its mandate.

CHRAJ, therefore, assumed a lead role in organising the workshop. However, from the beginning, the importance given to reinforcing collaboration and building effective partnerships between major stakeholders was reflected in the composition of the workshop planning committee

(See Appendix 1). This brought together representatives of civil society (including religious bodies and the media), individuals and the Executive Branch of government in a participatory planning process characterised by open and action-oriented discussion.

1.2 Purpose of the Workshop

The purpose of the workshop was to:

- a) generate widespread public awareness of the social and economic costs of corruption
- b) foster the creation of a positive and non-partisan approach towards combating corruption
- c) support and strengthen the executive branch/official and civil society commitment to combating corruption
- d) induce key leaders in government, public service, public agencies, private sector and civil society to co-operate in the effort to combat corruption
- e) foster sustained democratic governance and renewed economic growth.

1.3 Workshop Structure

The Vice-President of the Republic of Ghana opened the workshop. Plenary presentations by Ghanaian experts on aspects of corruption were interspersed with presentations on combating corruption through institutional

reforms by the Executive Director of Transparency International, the Assistant Director of the Anti-corruption Directorate of Botswana and the former Chairman of the Hong Kong Anti-Corruption Commission.

Syndicate Group discussions focussed on six major subject areas: constitutional and legal anti-corruption mechanisms; institutional reforms; the role of civil society in combating corruption; steps towards eliminating corruption in the health and education sectors; the role of the media in combating corruption; and corruption and the procurement process. All syndicate group work was oriented to the production of an Action Plan detailing parties responsible for implementation and the timeframe for review (see Action Plan). Music and drama interludes focussing on corruption were a welcome feature of the workshop. Even sceptics among participants grew to appreciate the power of these arts as tools for raising awareness on any topic and in this case on the subject of corruption. A powerful address by the Minister of Interior rounded off discussions.

1.4 Discussions

Almost every intervention from the floor cited personal experiences of corruption and the shift in societal norms that is taking place, as the problem becomes more widespread. While some participants called for a focus on the “big fishes”, the frank and lively discussions led to consensus on the need for civil society, government and the private sector to work together in combating corruption. Participants appreciated the essential role that the Executive and Government have to play in supporting efforts to promote national integrity. There was agreement on three major strategic focus areas: instituting legal and administrative reforms to limit the opportunities for

corruption; strengthening and enforcement of existing laws; and the launch of a concerted and long term public education campaign both to educate citizens on their rights and responsibilities and to increase understanding of the real costs of corruption. Conscious of the failure of prior attempts to combat corruption, a request was made to research the reasons behind these failures so as to better ensure the success of the current initiative.

There was one important area where consensus was not achieved. A number of speakers mentioned the establishment of a specialised institution with a mandate to fight corruption as a critical factor in the success of anti-corruption efforts. However, other interventions, including that of the Vice-President of the Republic of Ghana indicated that the establishment of such an institution would be of limited value. Creating a specialised and well-resourced unit within CHRAJ with a specific mandate to combat corruption was identified as a useful strategy in moving forward.

The discussions benefitted immensely from the quality of the presentations. There was also a great deal of interest in the experience of other countries, in particular that of Botswana. The debate on issues relating to procurement went into considerable depth reflecting the level of public concern with regard to corruption in this area.

1.5 Summary of Major Action Steps

A full list of the major action steps is listed in the recommended Action Plan. This attributes responsibilities and indicates timeframes. A series of stakeholder consultations is to take place with the key partners in order to confirm their commitment to the process and to jointly assess how to deal with any eventual bottlenecks.

◆ *Raising Public Awareness*

- Launch of a National Integrity Week and launch of National Integrity Awards to serve as a focus for public education activities;
- Increased public education on citizens' rights and responsibilities using Ghanaian languages;
- Development of a systematic integrity curriculum for use throughout the school system;
- Organisation of a 2nd National Integrity Workshop with the participation of the security services;
- Organisation of Regional Fora along the lines of the National Integrity Workshop;
- Creation of a Civil Society Umbrella organisation to promote National Integrity;
- Networking of NGOs to periodically discuss progress on the public anti-corruption campaign;
- Review and enforcement of Codes of Conduct by professional bodies including media practitioners;
- Public education on professional Codes of Conduct;
- Introduction of specific curricula with regard to corruption and investigative journalism in media training institutions.

◆ *Legal and Administrative Reforms*

It should be noted that the National Institutional Renewal Programme (NIRP) is pushing forward with key reforms that will address issues relating to national integrity. The elements of the following listing that relate to these initiatives is intended to highlight participants concerns:

- Launch of a campaign for a Freedom of Information Bill;
- Empowerment of CHRAJ through improved legislation and resource allocation and including procedural rules to enforce orders made by CHRAJ;
- Introduction of a new law clearly setting out the terms of public procurement and the penalties for non-observance of the law;
- Reinforcement of existing initiatives towards appropriate salaries and wages with specific attention to staff in "at risk" positions;
- Streamlining of procedures and rotation of staff in "at risk" positions;
- Improved coordination between the Lands Commission, Land Title Registry, Town and Country Planning and the Survey Department;
- Development of clear guidelines for the selection of paupers under the "Cash and Carry" system with greater community involvement;
- Information on the exact allocation of supplies to each specific school should be given to school boards and PTAs;
- Establishment of a Central Admissions Bureau with representation from School Boards and PTAs

Strengthening and Enforcement of Existing Laws

All participants agreed on the importance of ensuring compliance with the existing laws for combating corruption. The effective enforcement of laws is, of course, highly dependent on the commitment and integrity of law enforcement agencies.

ACTION STEPS

Action	Who is responsible	Time Frame	Expected Impact	Status
FOLLOW-UP TO THE INTEGRITY WORKSHOP				
Separate stakeholder meetings with all responsible partners listed in the Action Plan to discuss implementation (e. g. Attorney General's Office, Ministry of Communications, MOH, MOE, National Institutional Renewal Programme (NIRP), Parliament) Produce final document setting out agreed responsibilities and timeframe for action	CHRAJ Post-Workshop Implementation Committee	January 1999	Commitment to the Action Plan	
Organisation of Regional Fora along the lines of the integrity workshop	CHRAJ	March 1999	Awareness raising Mobilisation of society against corruption	
PUBLIC AWARENESS RAISING				
Launch of a National Integrity Week to serve as a focus for public education activities and during which awards will be given to people who have consistently upheld the principles of national integrity	NCCE CHRAJ Ministry of Communications NGOS Media	September 1999	Greater public awareness with regard to costs of corruption and rewards of integrity	
Increased Public Education on citizen's rights and responsibilities. Public education, in Ghanaian languages as well as English, using print and broadcast media on the behaviour expected of public officials.	NCCE NGOS Media	Launch by March 1999	Greater public awareness with regard to costs of corruption and rewards of integrity	

Action	Who is responsible	Time Frame	Expected Impact	Status
CIVIL SOCIETY				
Creation of a civil society umbrella organisation possibly along the lines of Transparency International to protect informants in corruption cases and to lobby government for the creation of an independent anti-corruption body	CSOs CDD and Catholic Bishops Conference	Immediate	Supplement the efforts of public agencies and Government in promoting national integrity and fighting corruption and tap into CSOs and private sector resources.	
Networking of NGOs other CSOs to meet periodically to discuss issues relating to the public campaign against corruption	CDD and Catholic Bishops Conference	Immediate	Information-sharing, capacity-building and harmonisation of activities	
Professional Bodies Review Codes of Conduct and public education to inform the general public of the content of the revised codes	Professional Bodies including the Public Service	End 1999	Improved understanding of rights and responsibilities Greater prospects of enforcement	
LEGAL				
Repeal of laws on criminal libel, laws of sedition, the Official Secrets Act	Parliament CSO lobby	Mid 1999	Greater transparency More effective media	
Introduction of tax court days	Attorney-General's Department	2 nd Trimester 1999	Effective and prompt prosecution of offenders	
Passing of a Freedom of Information Bill	Parliament Media Lobby	End 1999	Greater Transparency	

Action	Who is responsible	Time Frame	Expected Impact	Status
<p>Empowerment of CHRAJ CHRAJ to be given a clear legal mandate with regard to corruption cases through improved legislation and resource allocation inter alia:</p> <p>Procedural rules should be made to regulate the enforcement of orders made by CHRAJ.</p>	Parliament Attorney-General's Office	End 1999	More effective action by CHRAJ	
<p>Procurement Introduction of a new law giving the terms of public procurement and penalties for non-observance of the law</p>	Parliament	End 1999	Improved procurement	
PUBLIC SERVICE				
<p>Reinforce existing initiatives towards introduction of appropriate public service salaries and wages with specific attention to staff regarded to be "at risk".</p>	Public Service Commission NIRP	July 1999	Increased efficiency and less opportunity for corruption	
<p>Reduction in physical contact between officials and the public</p>	Public Service Commission and key bodies such as CEPS and Lands Commission NIRP, NDPC.	End 1999	<p>Reduction in the opportunities for money to change hands</p> <p>Reduction in Red Tape</p> <p>Simplification of Procedures</p>	
<p>Bulk release of financial allocation to CHRAJ at the start of the financial year</p>	Ministry of Finance	Immediate		

Action	Who is responsible	Time Frame	Expected Impact	Status
Public Service Cont. Improved Co-ordination between the Lands Commission, land Title Registry, Town and Country Planning and the Survey Department	Lands Commission, Land Title Registry, Town and Country Planning and the Survey Department	Ongoing April 1999 for submission of workplan	Transparency in the land registration process Simplification of procedures	
Streamline Procedures, eliminate inefficiency and install a service orientation. This should include the development of a rotation policy allowing for rotation of staff in 'at risk' positions.	NIRP, Public Service Commission	Ongoing April 1999 for review of actions	Less opportunity for corruption	
EDUCATION				
Development of a systematic integrity curriculum incorporating visual aids, music, drama for use throughout the school system.	MOE, GES, NFED, NCCE	End 1999	Increased awareness of the costs of corruption	
School Boards and PTA's should be informed of the exact allocation of supplies to the schools under their responsibility.	GES in conjunction with District Assemblies	Mid-1999	Elimination of diversion of supplies	
A Central Admissions Bureau should be established with representation from School Boards and PTA's	GES, PTA's	Prior to next Admissions exercise	Transparency in the selection of students and admission on the basis of merit	
MEDIA				
Set and raise standards through enforcement of codes of conduct and improved training, introduction of specific curricula with regard to corruption and investigative journalism	All training institutions for journalists and in collaboration with the Ghana Journalists Association	Prior to start of next academic year	Improved delivery of media services	

Action	Who is responsible	Time Frame	Expected Impact	Status
HEALTH				
Development of Clear Guidelines for the selection of paupers under the 'Cash and Carry' System This could include greater community involvement in the review of applications	Ministry of Health	March 1999	Improved Management of the Cash and Carry Scheme Elimination of discretionary powers of medical staff	
PROCUREMENT				
Project beneficiaries to be involved in reviewing the procurement processes with regard to projects in their communities	National Tender Board, District Assemblies, Contractors Association	End 1999		
Update of the contractor classification Register to ensure that individual contractor classification reflects their ability to execute contracts within their classification category	Contractors Association Ministry of Works	May 1999	Improvement in the bidding process for contracts	
Development of a training package on procurement to be used at the District Levels and in major decentralised institutions carrying out procurement	Contractors Association			
Blacklisting of contractors who carry out shoddy work	Parliamentary Committee on Works and Housing Contractors Association Ministry of Works, Ministry of Roads and Transport	Immediate	Greater professionalism among contractors	
Establishment of mechanisms to detect collusive tendering	Ministry of Finance District Assemblies Contractors Association	Mid 1999	Greater Transparency in the procurement Process	

AREAS OF FURTHER RESEARCH				
Present state of delivery of judicial services Role of Attorney-General's Office in the Administration of Justice				
How Procurement Works at the District Level Current application of procedures in IRS, Lands Department and CEPS Application of the Cash and Carry System				

2. Workshop Proceedings

Opening Session - Summary of Presentations

2.1 *Opening Statement - Mr. Enile Francis SHORT, Commissioner, Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice*

There is increasing recognition of corruption as a national development issue in Ghana. The enormous costs of corruption can be measured not only in terms of the loss of funds for development, over-inflated administrative costs and capital flight, but also in terms of the loss of legitimacy and respect for constituted authority, public loss of confidence in systems and institutions and lowering of moral values. Corruption has a way of rewarding mediocrity.

For CHRAJ, corruption is a fundamental violation of the citizens' rights. CHRAJ's role in combating corruption derives from statutory and constitutional provisions, notably Article 218 of the 1992 Constitution. However, ambiguities remain with regard to the interpretation of these provisions and, in conjunction with human and financial resource constraints, these limit CHRAJ's effectiveness. The need for a separate well-resourced body with a clear mandate to combat corruption is one area that should be examined.

Given the limited success of previous attempts to combat corruption based on legislation and prosecution, there is a need to establish a national integrity system with primary emphasis on changing systems rather than blaming individuals. The national integrity

system would highlight preventive aspects in order to make corruption a high risk, low gain undertaking. Building such an integrity system requires a participatory process in which Government is encouraged to engage civil society in the fight against corruption in order to create greater awareness and action on the issue. The eight inter-dependent pillars of a national integrity system are:

- 1) Development of public sector anti-corruption strategies
- 2) Establishment of independent anti-corruption agencies with adequate powers
- 3) An enhanced role for the media
- 4) Creation of greater public awareness about the cost of corruption in order to reduce tolerance levels
- 5) Active participation of civil society in the fight against the problem
- 6) Public participation in the democratic process
- 7) Accountability of the judiciary
- 8) International cooperation.

This presentation also addressed workshop goals, content, and structure (see section 1.2 above for details).

2.2 Statement by Betrand De SPEVILLE, former Chairman of the Independent Commission Against Corruption, Hong Kong and presently of de Speville and Associates, U.K.

Corruption is a universal phenomenon. However, it is widely recognized that Hong Kong has been able to bring corruption under control.

Original attempts to curb corruption in Hong Kong using more and more severe criminal laws did not work. Corruption grew to the point that the social order risked breaking down. Corruption in the police force was central to the development and continuation of the problem. Young recruits were told "You can ride on the bus, you can run alongside the bus, but don't stand in the way of the bus".

When public resignation and cynicism turned to rage, the Government took the political decision to transfer the responsibility for investigating corruption away from the police to a new independent organisation called the Independent Commission Against Corruption (ICAC). This was responsible for implementing a three pronged strategy:

- i enforcement of the laws against bribery and corruption
- ii eliminating the opportunities for corruption from public and private sector systems
- iii a campaign to get the public sensitized to corruption and willing to help fight it.

The recipe for success included a number of ingredients:

- i the political decision and determination to fight corruption
- ii adequate and sustained funding

- iii a strong framework of anti-corruption laws comprising simple, clear and protective provisions, comprehensive investigatory powers and protective provisions for informants
- iv a coherent and complete strategy that includes investigation, prevention and education
- v a willingness by Government to keep on fighting
- vi active community involvement.

Some lessons learned during 25 years of fighting corruption include ensuring that the legislation establishing the anti-corruption machinery incorporates a set time for the whole apparatus to be reviewed. Also, the delicate question of whether or not to grant amnesty for past conduct should be clarified from the start.

2.3 Key Note Address - H.E. John ATTA-MILLS, Vice-President of the Republic of Ghana

The costs of corruption are far greater both in terms of money and orderly social development than most realise. People are unjustly denied access to services and facilities to which they have a right, simply because they cannot afford or refuse to pay the demands of those whose duty it is to serve them. The cost of both Government and private business is inflated, whilst efficiency is undermined, with negative consequences for social and economic development.

These social and economic costs can be quantified. However, the moral cost of corruption is hard to define. Corruption breeds cynicism, hypocrisy and the elevation of material gain and influence above principle.

A number of institutions and modalities exist to combat corruption in Ghana. These include the SFO; CHRAJ; specialised units within the CID; the Auditor-General's office; the media; political platforms and many others. Instead of adding yet another organisation, there must be a return to fundamentals, i.e., the moral values upon which any decent society must be founded.

Moral training starts in the home. Integrity is an integral part of an individual's character. Laws and organisations cannot impose it. Therefore, while we work to make our institutions more effective in exposing and penalising corruption, we need to embark on a complementary moral crusade. We need to come out with practical and workable suggestions, which will enhance the moral integrity of our nation.

2.4 Chairperson's Remarks by Nana (Dr.) S.K. B. ASANTE, International Legal Consultant, Chairperson Public Utilities Regulatory Commission

Integrity "touches and concerns" us all. It is critical to our system of governance, the quality and sustainability of our economic growth, the viability of our techniques of social justice, the efficacy of our system of justice and our national moral fibre.

Examples of distorted international commercial and aid related transactions clearly demonstrate the global nature of corruption. However, there are encouraging developments in the international arena namely:

- The universal recognition that corruption subverts development and good governance;
- That this recognition is being translated into international action in the form of numerous multilateral and regional conventions and declarations

on the control or eradication of corruption in international commercial transactions, not to mention the crusade of non-governmental organisations such as Transparency International.

Furthermore, there is now a plethora of international instruments requiring contracting states to criminalise certain ingredients of a corrupt transaction. These include offering or giving any payment on behalf of an enterprise to a public official as undue consideration for performing or refraining from the performance of his duties as well as soliciting, demanding accepting or receiving, directly or indirectly similar payment by a public official.

Since the first Republic, there have been numerous attempts to combat corruption in Ghana. These have met with varying levels of success and clearly there is a need for more work to be done. The following aspects of creating a national integrity system need to be considered:

- Institutional reforms
- The elimination of wide discretionary powers wielded by certain officials
- The linkage between income levels and corruption in the civil service
- The need to have a comprehensive code of conduct for public officials
- The need to re-evaluate some of our cultural and traditional values
- State funding of political parties

The empirical evidence linking private funding of political parties or electoral campaigns with improper conferment of economic advantage is compelling, not only in Ghana but also in the developed countries.

3. Summary of Plenary Sessions and Discussions

First Plenary Session

Chair: Nana Araba APT - Director, Centre for Social Policy Studies

3.1 *Corruption and the Human Factor* – Rt. Rev. Charles PALMER-BUCKLE

Man is involved in a constant battle to rise above his baser instincts. Corruption is any human act that morally destroys or weakens something, somebody, society or institutions. The Transparency International definition is as follows: “corruption involves behaviour on the part of officials in the public sector, whether politicians or civil servants, in which they improperly and unlawfully enrich themselves or those close to them by the misuse of the public power entrusted to them”.

There are three major forms of corruption:

- ◆ **Petty/survival corruption:-** commonly perpetrated by a public official to supplement his or her meagre salary
- ◆ **Big time corruption:-** this can involve huge sums of money and is attributed to greed and selfishness or even the propensity for power. Inconsiderate demands from the extended family could be a factor.
- ◆ **Political corruption:-** the need to ensure “jobs for the boys”, pay back the costs of an election campaign, or finance future ones.

Corruption is anti-human. It is not the poor who are most corrupt. Many poor persons do not resort to corrupt practices to make ends meet. It is “the big men”, and people in leadership and in trust, such as Marcos and Mobutu, whose survival is assured a hundred times over, who indulge in corruption and with inhuman callousness. However, not every wealthy person is corrupt.

The Human factor must be understood in “building a collective plan of action for the creation of a national integrity system”. Human beings have a will, a conscience and the spiritual strength to resist the pull of the baser self. The human factor has the germ of self-destruction as well as self-transcendence.

The need for survival must be guaranteed by whatever human institutions the individual belongs to; be it the family, the tribe, the place of work or the State. This is a right. Parents, the wider family, teachers, the Church and other religions must contribute to the moral education of the individual so as to encourage the joys of virtue and excellence for the greater good of society. A system should be in place that will guarantee needs as well as protect the weak against the rapaciousness of the strong. The State is there to protect the poor, not to join in their exploitation by the rich and the strong. Therefore, we need a system of political administration that will enforce the laws,

protect rights and guarantee the needs of the weak against the rapaciousness of the strong.

3.2. *Review of Official Mechanisms for Combating Corruption* - Mr. Yaw ASAMOA and Dr. E. GYIMAH-BOADI.

Corruption in Ghana has been fought on two broad fronts; through the criminal justice system and the use of constitutional mechanisms.

The criminal justice system is part of the larger judicial system, which covers the courts and tribunals with administrative staff, prisons, the Attorney General's office, the Police Service with its associated agencies like the Bureau of National Investigations, Economic Crimes Bureau and specialised independent offices like the Serious Fraud Office.

The Attorney General sits at the apex of the criminal justice system. To be effective, it is important that the Attorney General is impartial. The current position is complicated since, in practice, the Attorney General is a politician and therefore part of the ruling party. The Serious Fraud Office (SFO) is a specialized agency of Government set up to monitor, investigate and, on the authority of the Attorney General, prosecute any offence involving serious financial or economic loss to the state and to make provision for connected and incidental purposes. SFO does not have a specific anti-corruption function. Fraud is not exclusive of corruption or vice versa but fraud tends to connote outright theft while corruption implies abuse of trust and misuse of influence.

The failure of the orthodox criminal justice system in combating corruption lies mainly in procedural shortcomings. The judicial system is slow, cumbersome and full of evidential principles, which are easily exploited on behalf of accused persons.

Quasi-Judicial structures such as Commissions of Enquiry, "Probes" have been used by a number of regimes in attempts to curb corruption. These sometimes draconian tools have violated the canons of natural justice. Yet, this extremism failed as the present concern about the upsurge of corruption demonstrates. Constitutional mechanisms for combating corruption include CHRAJ (which regrettably does not have clear-cut powers for enforcing its decisions), the Auditor-General's office and the Public Accounts Committee of Parliament. The Code of Conduct for Public Officers set out in the 1992 Constitution covers conflicts of interest, declaration of assets and liabilities and the institution to handle complaints about contravention. Unfortunately, the Public Officers Declaration Bill, which was recently passed and has been sent for Presidential assent, has loopholes.

A cynical public has largely ignored verbal exhortations and moral crusades against corruption.

The mechanisms for combating corruption in Ghana suffer from common deficiencies: material factors (for example, a resource poor judiciary), political interference, cross regime problems and overlapping jurisdictions as well as a forest of anti-corruption regulations and enforcement agencies none of which has a conclusive mandate.

3.3 *Investigative Journalism: Role and Challenges in Combating Corruption in Ghana* - Mr. William NYARKO

Corruption thrives on secrecy. The media by bringing corruption into public view acts as a powerful deterrent. The media has an important role to play in educating the public on the real costs of corruption such that cynicism and acceptance are no longer the

norm. Corruption is always worse in countries where transparency is lacking and where the freedom of the press is not guaranteed.

The work of an investigative journalist is sometimes lonely and risky. Often, one relies on a member of the public to sound the alert on instances of corruption. Once started on a story, systematic follow-up and monitoring are essential. Close attention should also be paid to building broad-based coalitions with anti-corruption institutions in the public and private sectors, civil society and the international donor community (this last in cases where it is suspected that international development assistance is being diverted). Abuse of procurement funded through donor assistance is of particular concern.

In order for the press to fulfill its role effectively, freedom of the press must be part of the overall environment. However, with press freedom comes press responsibility. Journalists need to stand on a high moral ground to be effective players in the combat against corruption. Low salary levels for

journalists should not give rise to unethical behaviour such as money changing hands for stories to be "killed".

In Ghana today, the greatest challenge to the investigative journalist in curbing corruption is a restrictive legal regime that criminalises freedom of expression. The criminal libel laws enacted by our erstwhile colonial masters to restrict freedom of speech remain on our statute books more than 40 years after we fought for and gained our independence. An equally important challenge is the absence of a Right of Information Bill, which would enjoin public office holders to give information and grant access to journalists and the public. It is reassuring to note that at the just ended National Communications Policy Workshop, participants suggested the scrapping of the Official Secrets Act along with the seditious libel laws and all laws that stand in the way of the free flow of information. We, in the media, need all your support if we are to remain in the business of better informing you. Every time you buy a paper or listen to a broadcast, which represents quality journalism, you support us and this counts.

Second Plenary Session

Chair: Nana Araba APT - Director, Centre for Social Policy Studies

3.4 *Corruption and the Private Sector* - Mr. Kwasi ABEASI

Corruption has reached such proportions that each country is to report, to the UN, on the steps it is taking to address the problem. We may not be able to eradicate corruption but we can reduce it.

One definition of corruption is the "misuse of public power for private profit". It always involves two parties the "corrupter", or the

influencing party, and the "corrupted", that is, the one whose integrity is impaired by the action.

Therefore corruption cannot be the monopoly of the public sector. Corruption in the public service or in Government circles usually reveals that the influence or corrupter is from the private sector. The private sector includes the local or indigenous private sector and an external or foreign private sector. The latter is usually governed by codes of ethics and good business practice but there

is evidence of increased levels of corruption in international contract administration.

The TI Source book sets out two major types of corruption; administrative corruption and political corruption. Political corruption is easily identifiable. Administrative corruption can be more difficult to identify. There are two main types; "according to rule" and "against the rule". In the first situation, an official is receiving private gain illegally for doing something that he or she is ordinarily required to do by law. In the second situation, the bribe or consideration is paid to obtain services which the official is prohibited from providing. These can occur at all levels and range in scale and impact from grand corruption to more ordinary or petty corruption.

The major cause of corruption is greed and selfishness. It is known that in most African countries it is difficult to win a major Government contract without a large bribe. Also companies without work may seek to create work by offering very attractive bribes to decision makers to approve unneeded purchases or projects. Since procurement and the award of contracts appear to be the activities most prone to corruption, we need to focus attention on these areas.

Civil society must be involved in any successful effort at combating corruption. A simple way of making an impact is to remove the conditions that allow the public sector to become easily corrupted and the private sector operator to want to corrupt the public officer. This will require organisational and attitudinal changes of the public service and measures such as:

- improving work methods and procedures to reduce delay;
- increasing the effectiveness of supervision; and
- rotating officers to ensure that no officer or group of officers remains too long at a single operational unit.

The enactment of a gift policy, in some countries, has helped guide officers in terms of what is an acceptable and "visible gift" versus an unacceptable and "invisible gift" or bribe.

Ghana's position as the 9th most corrupt nation according to the 1997 TI's Corruption Perception Index (CPI) shocked us all. The current release of TI's CPI indicates that we have moved to number 31. We still have a long way to go.

3.5 *The Procurement Process:* *A critique - Mr. David OFOSU-DORTE*

Corruption in procurement is an area of public concern. Unfortunately, the procurement process is generally misunderstood.

There are three major types of procurement; procurement of goods, services and works. In Ghana, the law requires that procurement of goods in the public sector is carried out by the central procurement agency; the Ghana Supply Commission (GSC). GSC is accused of being slow and many organisations are reluctant to give up the "leverage" that direct business with suppliers offers. The procurement of services in contrast to that of goods is completely decentralised. Procurement of works is governed by a number of regulations. Notably, the proliferation of contractors has led Government to introduce a classification process based on capacity assessment. While some contractors have managed to bypass the process and have successfully bid for contracts that they did not have the requisite equipment or experience to handle, the situation would have been much worse without the classification requirement.

Presently, the various procedures used for procurement by Government may be grouped as follows:

1. Sole sourcing/negotiated contracts:- only one bidder is involved to whom the contract is simply awarded. Obviously, favorites can be chosen.

2. Selective/Restricted tenders:- this involves restricting the tender to a known group of contractors. This is also open to abuse.

3. Competitive bids:- there are two types; national competitive bids and international competitive bids. The full process of competitive bidding is as follows:

a The Invitation

The project is advertised openly inviting bids. Many Government of Ghana contracts are not openly advertised.

b The Sale of Tender Documents

Tricks such as collusive tendering (a group of contractors decide which one of them will win the contract and adjust their bids accordingly) or a single contractor can buy all the documents and submit the bid under different names.

c Bid opening

When bid opening is attended by bidders or their agents there is less corruption. Often, in Ghana bidders are not informed of the opening of the bids and also records of the bid opening are not kept.

d Evaluation

At present there is no clear-cut policy on evaluation of tenders.

Previously, bids within 10% of the engineer's estimates were used. Donor agencies insist on using the lowest price. For procurement of works the lowest bid method is recommended but there is the need to streamline the evaluation criteria for other types of procurement.

e Awards

This is the stage where a particular bidder is given the authority to carry out the contract.

f Post Awards

Here corruption is often linked to the release of payments to contractors as each stage of the work is completed.

The following recommendations are made with a view to combating corruption:

- ◆ Public officials involved in projects should be given incentives to make corruption less attractive;

- ◆ Some standard procedures to govern the tenders of public authorities should be in place, i.e., statutory requirements;

- ◆ Prohibition of non-commercial considerations. This would exclude subjective considerations such as the neatness of documents and political influence;

- ◆ Regular policy directives. For example, no legislative instrument or executive instrument exists to regulate the work of the Regional Tender Boards;

- ◆ Establishment of an effective complaints mechanism;

- ◆ Self restraint by those in authority.

3.6 The Cost of Corruption in Health and Education Institutions: Ms. Audrey GADZEKPO and Dr. A. Lamensdorf OFORI-ATTA

Media coverage of the corruption in the health and education sectors confirms that these sectors are not exempt from the general malaise. This is corroborated by the research (1998) conducted by the Centre for Democracy and Development (CDD), Ghana, where 56% of respondents used “contacts” to gain admission for their wards in the SSS. In the health sector, respondents indicated that voluntary gifts were given to obtain quick service, indicate gratitude or to establish future contacts. Mortuary services are one area where corruption is well entrenched.

The main problem areas are as follows:

- i Administrative
 - Award and supervision of contracts;
 - Procurement of supplies – often, centralised purchase of supplies is not adequately monitored;
 - Diversion of supplies such as medicines;
 - Food procurement in educational and medical establishments; and
 - Lack of management training for key officials.
- ii Institutional
 - Poor management of store rooms;
 - Lack of policy guidelines for establishing who qualifies as a pauper under the cash and carry system;
 - poor classroom teaching so as to guarantee that students will pay for extra classes;

- Admissions at all levels in the educational system; and
- Sexual harassment where students give out sexual favours in exchange for grades or teachers use their authority to force students to grant sexual favours.

The consequences of corruption are both human and financial. Already strained institutions are being bled of what little financial resources they have due to embezzlement, misuse of institutional property, pilfering and outright theft of supplies. Often, it is those who can ill-afford to pay who are compelled by circumstance to “do something”. In human terms, when food meant for students and patients is diverted or drugs are pilfered, corruption cost lives.

In the education sector, lack of transparency in admission practices coupled with the misuse of authority undermines trust, compromises the integrity of respected institutions of learning and contributes to the fall in educational standards.

In the focus group section of the research carried out by CDD, some participants felt that there is nothing wrong in giving out something in cash or kind to a public official to achieve a goal. Factors identified as contributing to corruption include; low levels of salaries in the public sector, the get-rich-quick attitude of Ghanaians, ignorance or lack of information about processes and over-subscription of services. Others are weak institutional structures, lack of monitoring and the general absence of accountability. Audits, either internal or those carried out by the Auditor-General’s office, are largely treated as a formality.

Separation of powers is problematic and those who could act as a check, for example accountants, do not feel autonomous enough

to do so. Key officers are often too poorly trained to carry out their functions. When discretionary powers rather than laid down rules and guidelines are the norm, corruption will flourish.

The cynicism of the general public will need to be addressed by creating a better understanding of the consequences of corruption. More empirical studies need to be carried out.

Third Plenary Session

Chair: Dr. Charles ASEMBRI - Director of CEPS

3.7 *Combating Corruption through Institutional Reform* - **Nihal JAYAWIKRAMA, Executive Director, Transparency International**

Ghanaian civil society is alive, healthy and vibrant as demonstrated by your free expression on the subject of corruption. Corruption is not peculiar to Ghana. It is a global phenomenon. Among those convicted recently of corruption were the Auditor-General of New Zealand, a French Minister and a Canadian Minister. In all those countries, the offenders were brought to justice. Their systems worked. The challenge, therefore, is to make our systems work as well. This is fundamental to a viable anti-corruption strategy.

When we focus solely on prosecution, we focus on the symptoms without treating the causes of the disease. Conventional wisdom dictates that a country should enact legislation to criminalize corruption. When laws do exist, they are usually not applied at all or tend to be directed at “small fish” rather than “big fish” or selectively at political opponents no longer holding public office.

What appears to work is a package of laws including most if not all of the following:

- a) A law that requires the regular declaration of the assets, income, liabilities of decision-makers and other public officials;
- b) A law to identify, prevent or resolve a conflict of interest;
- c) A law to enable the citizen to obtain information in the possession of the state, i.e., an access to information law;
- d) A constitutionally entrenched Bill of Rights that recognizes the rights to freedom of expression, assembly and association;
- e) The common law principles of administrative law. The application of these principles will ensure that public officials do not exercise discretionary power vested in them by law for improper purposes;
- f) A strong recovery mechanism under the civil law (burden of proof is the balance of probabilities as opposed to beyond reasonable doubt).

Opportunities for corruption can be minimized through systematic reform such as:

- a) Narrowly defining the discretionary element in decision making;
- b) Redesigning, if not discontinuing, the mass of rules and regulations, and procedures and formalities;
- c) Establishing improved and readily accessible and transparent public procurement procedures;
- d) Privatisation;
- e) Administrative reforms that minimise the opportunities for corrupt practices;
- f) The demystification of Government. This is achieved by rendering the decision-making processes transparent;
- g) A meritocratic civil service.

To reduce the inclination to engage in corrupt transactions, it is necessary to strengthen the processes, which are used to curb corruption. These constitute the interdependent pillars of the national integrity system:

- a) An independent commission against corruption charged with the implementation of anti-corruption legislation;
- b) An independent prosecuting agency;
- c) An independent, impartial and informed judiciary;
- d) An Auditor-General with responsibility for auditing government income and expenditure ;

- e) An ombudsman who receives and investigates allegations of maladministration.

Two additional pillars are an elected legislature and a free media.

However, without Government's support, an anti-corruption programme cannot succeed. Also, experience shows that it is often better to start with a clean slate and focus on the future rather than the past.

Today, there are over 70 national chapters of TI, either established or in formation, which are seeking to involve civil society in the reform process. TI believes that for reform to be effective it must be driven by local needs and consideration. Those who best understand the problems of corruption in a country are those who live and work there and who have deep insights into their own society.

3.8 Botswana's Approach to Corruption - Adolph HIRSCHFELD - Assistant Director, Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime, Botswana

The pace of Botswana's development since gaining independence in 1966 has provided many opportunities for corruption and economic crime in both the public and private sectors; opportunities that undoubtedly have been exploited. Corrupt transactions result in loss, but the loser, the State or the principal of one of the corrupt parties usually never knows that the offence has occurred. Fortunately, corruption has never been publicly acceptable in Botswana and when scandals did erupt they were met with general condemnation. In response to several major corruption scandals that occurred in the late 1980s and early 1990s, Commissions of Enquiry were set up. These helped establish that in order to deal

effectively with the problem the following were essential:

- Political will;- the determination and full acceptance by those in power that the problems should be resolutely addressed, and that those involved in corruption and economic crime should face the full rigour of the law irrespective of their status or political affiliation.
- Effective legislation;- changes in the law are necessary to create clearly defined offences, provide unusual powers of investigation, create rebuttable presumptions and create effective deterrent punishments for those convicted.
- Specific resources;- the special powers of investigation, specialised investigation techniques and experience required to deal with the most sophisticated types of corruption, as well as the co-ordination of existing law-enforcement agencies, which is often required in dealing with corruption, are functions that do not sit well with a conventional agency and, in Botswana's case, necessitated a specialised agency.
- Determined and unfettered prosecution of offences;- there must be no political or other interference with procedures.
- Public education on the detrimental effects of corruption and economic crime and fostering support for the anti-corruption campaign.
- Analyses of existing legislation, systems, management, ethics and

codes of conduct;- unenforced or unenforceable legislation, complex and outdated regulations, complex and outdated administrative systems, inadequate service capability compared with demand, poor management and management structures, inadequate control over tendering and purchasing, inappropriate vestings of discretion, the absence of effective systems of accountability, the absence of codes of conduct and ethics or, where they exist, non-compliance with them contribute to creating the environment for corruption to exist.

- A determination to continue the campaign.

The Government of Botswana took all of the above into consideration in enacting legislation to establish a dedicated anti-corruption body, that is, the Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime. DCEC now has an establishment of 100 officers who implement the "three-pronged approach" - coordination of three functions; investigation and prosecution, public education and prevention. Although this is producing satisfying results, it is recognised that in a democratic and free society there is no quick fix and the campaign needs to be constantly sustained and reinforced.

3.9 Summary of Plenary Discussions

The following sets out the main viewpoints expressed, concerns raised and specific action points recommended during the plenary discussions that followed the above presentations.

It is impossible here to do full justice to the rich debate. Almost everyone who spoke took the opportunity to illustrate their point

with references to first hand experiences of corruption. Areas that proved problematic and warranted many interventions concerned spirituality vs. materialism in the Ghanaian Church, and whether or not the state can afford to pay a living wage to public sector workers. The presentations on approaches used in other countries attracted a great deal of interest. For example, participants asked themselves whether fundamental differences of character between the people in Botswana and those in Ghana would affect the choice of an anti-corruption strategy. The paper on procurement also proved of considerable interest since many participants had little background on this crucial subject.

The key areas are as follows:

- ◆ **Moral education**

The Church and religious leaders must inculcate sound moral/ spiritual values among their members. The exorbitant financial demands that some churches make on their members encourage materialism.

In addition to public education efforts, it is particularly important to target education for the youth and to evolve a curriculum for primary schools to educate young people about the evils of corruption. This will also give people the moral courage to resist the temptation of corruption.

A dissenting view drew attention to the importance of social influence. If children see that in their society corruption pays, no amount of education will stop them from being corrupt. The behaviour of adults is the key influence on children's behaviour.

- ◆ **Public education**

The fight against corruption will succeed only through concerted and sustained effort of Government and civil society. Educating the youth on the consequences of corruption should be a priority.

An award should be instituted to recognise moral integrity of officials in the public sector, private sector and corporate bodies.

- ◆ **Definition of corruption**

Corruption should not be understood narrowly as the offering/ receiving of bribes. Economic crime including fraud should be included in the definition.

- ◆ **Legal**

The laws, which penalise corruption, must be enforced. People found the Attorney General's right to end a legal process against persons charged with corruption a problem.

People are reluctant to expose corrupt officials for fear of being victimised. A law to provide persons with immunity should be enacted.

The legislative instrument setting up CHRAJ should be reviewed in the areas of its power to prosecute and the relationship CHRAJ has with the Attorney-General's office.

- ◆ **Demystification of Government**

The Official Secrets Act is incompatible with the demystification of Government. There must be the

political will to introduce a public information act.

In Botswana demystification of Government is partly the result of socialisation but has also been consciously promoted by the Government.

The publication and dissemination of procedures and guidelines of government departments is an important strategy in demystifying government.

- ♦ **The Role of the Media**

While the efforts of investigative journalists must be applauded, the fact that there are approximately 150 libel cases pending against journalists suggests that the Ghana Journalists Association should endeavour to better enforce its code of ethics.

- ♦ **Anti-corruption Bodies**

Difficulties in reconciling the secrecy requirements of an anti-corruption body with the value of transparency and justice were an issue that was raised. In the Botswana case, effective monitoring is used as a deterrent to the abuse of power. For example, no one person has the power to introduce or close investigations. Furthermore, testimony is video-taped.

Clarification was, also, requested concerning selection of officers of the Botswana Directorate. Initially, these were recruited from ICAC in Hong Kong, personnel were also seconded from the Police force and from the University. The selection process includes vetting by both the Government and the Directorate.

Also, while Botswana's DCEC is funded by the state it is operationally independent except

An anti-corruption body should be careful to distinguish between perception and reality and not cater to public whims in the investigation and prosecution of anti-corruption cases.

- ♦ **A living wage**

Better remuneration of employees would curb the incidence of corruption.

- ♦ **Public Office**

Officials should be made to resign when they are found to be corrupt. The current practice would appear to be that they are "recycled". Public servants should be made to understand that their assignments are an opportunity to serve and not to steal. Red tape must be eliminated.

- ♦ **Research**

There was a seeming consensus on the value of conducting more systematic research into the phenomenon of corruption.

4 Summary of Syndicate Group Discussions and recommended Action Steps

The six syndicate groups were asked to keep their work focussed on defining action steps specifying who would be responsible for taking action as well as the timing (start/end dates and duration). The following sets out the Discussion and the recommended Action Steps that emerged from each Working Group. It should be noted that in many cases the timing was not specified since there was agreement that action should be immediate and continuous until the expected results are achieved.

4.1 Group 1 - Constitutional and Legal Anti-Corruption Mechanisms

TASK Review the effectiveness of existing institutions to combat corruption and examine the possibility of establishing a specific anti-corruption body.

Discussion points: generating public demand for greater institutional effectiveness, adequacy of legislation, availability of trained personnel, links between institutions such as the Police, Judiciary, CHRAJ and SFO.

Chairperson: *Mr. William BOAFO, Vice President, GBA*

Rapporteur: *Dr Ken. ATTAUAH*

Number of Persons in Group - 17

A Discussion

The group identified the following constitutional mechanisms:

1. The Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice
2. The Auditor-General
3. The Public Accounts Committee of Parliament
4. The constitutional provisions for the establishment of Commissions of Enquiry
5. The Code of Conduct for public officers, which includes a requirement to declare one's assets before, during and after office
6. Limit of discretionary power
7. Prohibition against holding public office by persons against whom adverse findings have been made by Commissions of Enquiry.

The institutions for combating corruption include the following:

1. The Ghana Police Service, with its several agencies including the Bureau of National Investigations (BNI), the Economic Crimes Bureau, the Police Striking Force, the Panthers and Commandos;
2. The Serious Fraud Office, which is a statutory agency with responsibility for preventing and monitoring serious fraud in Ghana. It is primarily mandated to investigate financial and economic crimes injurious to the state. The SFO has a mandate to freeze the assets or bank account of any person suspected of corruption (without prior notification). In addition, it

can, through the office of the Attorney General, initiate criminal prosecution against any person where it finds reasonable basis in the evidence for doing so.

The powers and functions of these institutions were assessed against their effectiveness in acting against corruption. The following key concerns were identified:

- ◆ Maintaining the complementarity of functions while avoiding duplication of services is a major challenge;
- ◆ Existing organisations need to be strengthened through the provision of funding, personnel and other logistical support such that they can effectively discharge their functions;
- ◆ Operational independence and functional autonomy from Government are essential to establishing the integrity of anti-corruption organisations;
- ◆ The SFO has strong investigative powers including the unilateral ability to freeze assets. It has considerable dormant capacity;
- ◆ CHRAJ has a broad human rights and anti-corruption mandate that is likely to grow. CHRAJ lacks the power to find and commit individuals for contempt other than for failure to honour a subpoena. CHRAJ also does not have the statutory power to verify the accuracy of the assets declaration forms submitted to the Auditor-General.

B Recommended Action Steps

1. Parliament should initiate legislative reforms to strengthen CHRAJ. These could include:

- ◆ Giving CHRAJ the power to prosecute corruption cases. This will further ensure the operational independence and effectiveness of CHRAJ;
 - ◆ The provisions relating to the three-month lapse period for decisions of CHRAJ to become effective should be repealed to enable the immediate enforcement of such findings by CHRAJ;
 - ◆ Procedural rules should be made to regulate the enforcement of orders made by CHRAJ;
2. Government should increase funding to CHRAJ and other key anti-corruption institutions. If possible, funds should be released at the start of the year to allow for better financial planning.
 3. The Attorney General's supervision of SFO requires that the Attorney General's Office be effectively disengaged from strong political leanings to the ruling Government; that is the office should be depoliticised or made politically neutral.

4.2 Group 2 - Institutional Reforms in Key Institutions; the case of CEPS and the Lands Commission

- | | |
|-------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| TASK | Review institutional reform requirements using two institutions as demonstration cases - Customs Excise and Preventive Services and Lands Commission.
<i>Discussion points:</i> overhaul of procedures, overhaul of administrative set-up, conditions of service, the nature of a machinery for addressing public complaints/Ombudsperson. |
|-------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

Chairperson: *Ebow QUASHIE - Ghana Bar Association*

Rapporteur: *Dolly ACOLATSE*

Number of Persons in Group: 10

A Discussion

1. Customs Excise and Preventive Services

CEPS operates under PNDC Law 330 and is a member of the World Customs Organisation. Its objectives and functions are:

- ◆ Collection and accounting of all duties, taxes and revenues payable under the law
- ◆ To act as a trade facilitator within the context of VISION 2020.

The CEPS Board exists to ensure that CEPS fulfills these functions.

The major constraints in controlling corruption in CEPS are:

1. Current operating systems and procedures are not adequate to prevent revenue loss;
2. There is too much red tape;
3. The computer software system is inefficient and outdated;
4. Regulations are overly complex;
5. There is a mixture of manual and automated processes;
6. Valuation procedures are not consistent with international standards;
7. There is excessive physical examination of goods;
8. Lack of standardisation;
9. Lack of coordination among agencies at the borders;
10. Customs officials are influenced by importers;

11. Interference from Government and from politicians affect the work of officers;
12. Low staff remuneration;
13. Inadequate logistics;
14. The channel for addressing complaints is not clear cut;
15. Inadequate public information on the role of CEPS;
16. Rejection of forms by computers since they are usually not filled in properly.

II. The Lands Commission

The Lands Commission is one of the departments under the Ministry of Lands and Forestry and is also the primary institution in the management of public lands (Art 251 Clause 2 of the 1992 Constitution). Its functions include:

- ◆ managing all public lands;
- ◆ providing advisory services in general and specifically to the Land Title Registry;
- ◆ granting concurrence to stool lands transactions; and
- ◆ formulating recommendations with respect to land use.

The major constraints identified with regard to controlling corruption in the Lands Commission are:

1. Lack of a consolidated Land policy;
2. Litigation due to poor demarcation of lands especially in Accra and the Volta Region;
3. Lack of public awareness of procedures;
4. Cumbersome procedures;
5. The rudimentary nature of data storage and retrieval;
6. Poor documentation;
7. Insufficient qualified personnel;

8. Delayed compensation of land by Government thus leading to resale of lands by land owners;
9. Lack of logistics, e.g., vehicles, maps, etc.;
10. Poor conditions of service for the staff;
11. Lack of adequate funding; and
12. Lack of a machinery/ channel for dealing with complaints.

B Recommended Action Steps

I. Customs Excise and Preventive Services

It should be noted that many of the following recommendations are in line with issues identified within the frame-work of the draft CEPS corporate plan.

1. Certain aspects of the legislation should be reviewed. This should be done by the Attorney General's office, CEPS and Parliament;
2. CEPS should streamline clearing procedures;
3. System-based audit controls should be instituted by CEPS;
4. Information infrastructure should be restored by CEPS and the Ministry of Finance such that records are complete;
5. Physical contact between importers and customs officers should be kept to the barest minimum;
6. Completion of the ongoing information process to be completed in December 1999 by CEPS and the Ministry of Finance;
7. Public education campaigns should be intensified by CEPS and Ministry of Communications;
8. CEPS' officers should be provided with adequate logistics;
9. A mainframe should be provided to link up all sections of CEPS;

10. A complaints office should be established in CEPS;
11. The issue of setting aside special days to try tax cases, i.e., tax court days should be revisited;
12. Members of the public who try to influence customs officials should be prosecuted;
13. There should be frequent rotation of CEPS officers;
14. Staff should be adequately remunerated; and
15. Government and political interference should be eliminated.

II. The Lands Commission

1. Acquisition of Land Bank for more security of tenure;
2. Public education;
3. Coordination between Lands Commission, Land Title Registry and the Survey Department;
4. Improved conditions of service for staff;
5. Charging economic rates for services rendered to be able to provide better service;
6. Establishment of a mechanism for dealing with complaints; and
7. Computerisation to improve documentation and storage in order to create a one-stop shop from search to title.

4.3 Group 3 - The Role of Civil Society in Combating Corruption

- | | |
|-------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| TASK | To examine the role of civil society, that is, how to mobilise Ghanaian Society to address the problem of corruption and indicate specific action steps on what should be done. |
|-------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

Discussion points: the status of anti-corruption NGO's and civil society organisations, the possible structure and formatting of civil society input into anti-corruption projects.

Chairperson: **Mr. A.K. MENSAH**

Rapporteur: **Nana Akua ANYIDHO**

Number of Persons in Group: 26

A Discussion

The Group identified the following as key institutions of civil society; families, churches and other religious bodies, ethnic/ tribal associations, professional associations (Ghana Bar Association, GNAT, etc.) trade unions, student unions, Parent Teacher Associations, Chieftaincy institutions and the media. These institutions should be involved in implementing the following recommended Action Steps.

B Recommended Action Steps

i Civic and Moral Education

This would include:

- The development of a systematic integrity curriculum incorporating visual aids, music and drama;
- Public education on the behaviour expected of public officials and the social and economic costs of corruption. The messages and the supporting literature should be available in Ghanaian languages and English;
- Parent Teacher Associations should

be assisted by NGOs to recognise the valuable role they can play in the campaign against corruption;

- There should be sustained lobbying to ensure that the issue of corruption is on the agendas, manifestos and election campaign of political parties;
- A sustained publicity campaign to raise awareness on corruption, the avenues available for reporting specific cases and individual rights and powers.

The following organisations are of particular importance in moving the above agenda forward; the National Commission on Civic Education (NCCE), the Non-Formal Education Division (NFED) of the Ministry of Education, Traditional Councils, Religious Bodies and the media (print and electronic).

ii Review of Professional Code of Ethics

CHRAJ is to request the professional bodies to review their codes of ethics. This is to make the rights and responsibilities of their respective memberships clear to the public. The professional bodies should strengthen their disciplinary committees especially with regard to public complaints.

iii Networking

CDD and the Catholic Bishops Conference are to encourage the formation of a network of NGOs and other Civil Society Organisations to meet periodically to discuss issues relating to the public campaign against corruption.

A civil society umbrella organisation (possibly along the lines of Transparency

International) could be set up to help protect informants in corruption cases and to lobby Government for the creation of an independent anti-corruption body.

iv National Integrity Week

A National integrity week is to be organised under the auspices of CHRAJ (during which awards will be given to significant figures in the public campaign against corruption.

4.4 Group 4 - Towards Eliminating Corruption in the Health and Education Sectors

TASK To discuss a plan of action to combat corruption in the health and education sectors.
Discussion points: current procedures, transparency, complaint facilities and protection of “whistle-blowers” from victimization.

Chairperson: *Mr. Abeiku SAGOE - National Commission on Civic Education*

Rapporteur: *Gertrude YARTEY*

Number of Persons in Group: 16

A Discussion

1. Education

The major problems include:

1. Inadequate resources to meet demand (for example, there are not enough schools);
2. Inappropriate location of schools;
3. Inadequate pay and poor conditions of service contributing to low morale.

4. Corruption in the area of procurement is of particular concern.

II. Health

The major problems are:

1. Inadequate resources to meet demand - for example there are not enough consultants hence creating a role for hospital middlemen (usually hospital staff or members of the doctors family);
2. Regional and teaching hospitals are overcrowded; training institutions in the health sector face the same problems as other educational institutions;
3. There is lack of coordination between the MOH staff and revenue collecting staff who are usually not Staff of the Ministry;
4. Too much discretion is required of hospital staff with regard to the administration of the “cash and carry” scheme;
5. Remuneration levels are poor and this encourages brain drain and low morale; and
6. Corruption in the area of procurement is also of particular concern.

B Recommended Action Steps

1. Education

1. Increase the facilities available through the establishment of more training institutions and the provision of more educational

materials. Government should do this with the support of an Educational Trust;

2. Public education needs to be carried out on the cost of corruption. The media can play a valuable role in informing the public and in exposing instances of corruption;
3. There should be a stronger bond between teachers and the communities they serve. Government can also give teachers better support by increasing their wages;
4. Misappropriation of funds by heads of institutions is often the result of the need to bribe supply officers before allocations can be collected. Usually, there is a chain of demand - National, Regional, District Directorates to Heads of Institutions. MOE and GES can give supply lists to School Boards and PTAs. This will enable concerned parties to cross-check the quantity of supplies delivered against the original allocation;
5. Government and Civil Society including the Churches, the National Commission on Civic Education and the Ghana National Association of Teachers can provide moral education. For example, churches can educate members on morality instead of preaching prosperity.

Some members of this group decided to form themselves into a committee to work on this moral crusade.

6. With regard to the issue of admissions it was suggested that:

- a central admissions bureau should be established with representation from School Boards and PTAs;
- corrupt officials once identified should be effectively sanctioned and the current practice of simply transferring them to new locations should cease;
- MOE should establish a hot line in order to ensure that complaints are dealt with promptly. In general, there should be more publicity given to avenues for complaints;
- Middlemen should be eliminated from the admissions process by ensuring that parents have access to Admissions Boards. Also having the media present during key meetings of the Admissions Boards can improve transparency.

II. Health

1. Public education to publicize the complaint facilities that are available. This could include the establishment of an information desk at all health centres. Nurses should be educated on

the need to inform patients on the available services;

2. Improvements in the level of facilities available. This would effectively eliminate middlemen and queues for care. A national health insurance scheme could help provide the required additional finance;
3. Support through legislation for the establishment of private funeral homes to break the monopoly of the mortuaries;
4. A modality should be developed to collect consultation fees centrally and redistribute the amounts received among hospital staff and the Ministry. For example 70% to the doctor, 10% to nurses and 20% retained by the Ministry to help improve facilities; and
5. The cash and carry system should be refined so that the definition of a pauper is clear and hospital staff are not required to use their discretion.

4.5 Group 5 - The Role of the Media in Combating Corruption

Task To examine the role of the media in combating corruption and indicate specific steps to facilitate the media's effective performance of its role.

Discussion points: existing Legislation (Freedom of Information Act, Libel laws, criminal libel/ sedition, contempt of court - scandalising the court).

Chairperson: *Kwesi BINEY - Editor, The Guide*

Rapporteur: *Gilbert K. M. TEITAAH*

Number of Persons in Group: 24

A Discussion

The current key constraints, which prevent the media from fulfilling its role in combating corruption, include:

1. the absence of whistle-blower protection mechanisms;
2. existing legislation such as the Official Secrets Act;
3. the existing libel laws;
4. contempt of court and scandalising the court; and
5. lack of professional capacity among journalists.

B Recommended Action Steps

The implementation of these action steps will require the involvement of the Law Reform Commission, the Attorney-General's office, the Media Commission, the Ghana Bar Association, CHRAJ and the public.

◆ Protection Mechanisms

Journalism should be practised with the greatest professionalism and the investigation and exposure of alleged corrupt acts should be carried out in a non-partisan way. The greatest guarantee of protection against litigation will always remain the truth. However, journalists should benefit from liability insurance schemes designed to protect them from victimisation. All media houses are advised to hire legal advisors.

◆ Existing Legislation

As stated at the National Communications Policy Conference, the Official Secrets Act is inconsistent with the spirit of the constitution and it should be replaced by a Freedom of Information Act, which explicitly defines what constitutes classified information and hence the permissible parameters of journalistic license.

◆ Libel laws

The existing libel laws, in particular those on criminal libel and sedition, would seem to undermine the constitutional guarantees of free speech and expression. Furthermore, the unduly punitive penalties that these laws attract (such as huge fines and the denial of bail in some cases) emasculate the press in its role of putting suspects under the litmus test of journalistic enquiry. Consequently, the group proposed that these laws be expunged. The constitution contains adequate provisions to take care of speech that injures and this includes the constitutional right to rejoinders and the complaint processing function of the Media Commission.

Sanctions for contempt of court or scandalising the court should be limited to fines.

◆ Professional journalism

While free speech and expression remain legitimate constitutional rights, the enjoyment of such freedoms must be reconciled with the use and exercise of responsibilities. Journalists are encouraged to obey the ethics of their own profession specifically a commitment to truth, diligence in the choice of words and thorough investigation of facts as an essential ingredient of professionalism. In order to behave professionally journalists must be trained professionally and this will require improvements in the intake to schools of journalism as well as the quality of training offered there. It is essential that the professional code of conduct is enforced such as to ensure that journalists operate within its boundaries.

Once the above constraints are removed the media will be able to fulfill its role of participating actively in media campaigns to conscientise society on every citizen's role in ensuring accountability.

4.6 Group 6 - Corruption and the Procurement Process

Task To examine the issues relating to the procurement process.

Discussion points: existing procurement procedures, laws, key areas of corruption, transparency and competitiveness in the procurement process, mechanisms for protecting whistle-

blowers and for punishing those who "corrupt" the procurement process, public civil society oversight possibilities.

Chairperson: *Mr. OFOSU-DORTE*

Rapporteur: *Marilyn ANIWA*

Number of Persons in Group: 12

A Discussion

The current key constraints to a transparent procurement process include an inadequate legal framework. Existing laws include PNDC Law 245, which set up the Ghana Supply Commission and Act 462, which is the Local Government Act out of which L.I. 1606 was promulgated. The other rules in operation are not backed by legislation.

Often the World Bank procedures are adopted; however, these have not been passed by law. The Ministry of Finance also regularly issues guidelines that set award limits but these are not adequate to ensure transparency in the procurement process.

Key areas of the procurement process include the invitation stage, the evaluation stage, recruitment of consultants, supervision of contracts, and final evaluation of jobs.

Factors that encourage corruption include:

- ◆ The general lack of transparency in the procurement process including the lack of clarity in tendering procedures;

permanent membership of tender boards; delay of work leading to price variations; non-compliance with assets declaration required under LI1606 for tender board members; secrecy with regard to bids - bidders are not given equal access to information, such as requirements for the bid and specific details of the evaluation criteria. Lack of effective mechanisms to address the complaints of those who feel unfairly treated.

- ◆ There are also no mechanisms for punishing those who "corrupt" the procurement process; for example, retention of payments for contractors who are unable to complete jobs within specified periods. Also civil servants and other officials who collude with corrupt contractors are left unpunished. It should be noted that there is a general apathy and lack of public interest in projects that affect them and a general failure to complain about shoddy work.

B Recommended Action Steps

1. The enactment of a general law specifying procedures relating to the whole procurement process as well as punishments and prescribed offences. Lobbying will be required to move the requisite bill through Parliament. Liaison with the Ministry of Finance, Cabinet and the Attorney-General's Office as well as other public

sector and private sector institutions will be necessary since they have a stake in the matter.

2. Procedures for tendering should be clearly spelt out, and to the degree possible should be open and competitive
 - Bidders should be given equal access to information and always be invited to attend the opening of bids;
 - Evaluation criteria should be well publicised in advance;
 - The contractors classification register must be streamlined and updated;
 - Mechanisms for detecting collusive tendering must be set up;
 - Jobs must be estimated by qualified quantity surveyors; and
 - The use of restricted tenders and sole source tenders must be reduced
3. A complaints mechanism must be set up. If it comes into being, the proposed body to monitor corruption may be an appropriate institution to hear complaints.
4. Project beneficiaries must be educated on the value of showing active interest in projects and in particular tendering procedures. This will mean that District Assemblies, Unit Committees and Civil Society must be more involved in the project award process.
5. Incentives to public servants. There must be incentives to civil servants in charge of projects, to reduce the tendency to accept bribes.

4.7 Plenary Discussion on Syndicate Group Work

Although at this stage of the workshop time was very limited, a number of interesting comments and additions to the group reports came out during the plenary.

One suggestion was that, in contrast to the emphasis on CHRAJ as advocated by Group 1, the SFO should be strengthened. Some powers should be shifted away from CHRAJ to SFO. The new hybrid organisation should have a new name, be independent of Government, and should have the power to prosecute.

Another possibility, which was not raised by the working groups but came out in the plenary, was the possibility of establishing a separate judicial system to try corruption cases.

A number of interventions noted that Syndicate Group recommendations touch on issues enshrined in the constitution and hence caution is required.

Public education campaigns should make use of local vehicles for drama such as the concert parties.

Major Concerns

A major concern voiced during the plenary discussion on the Syndicate Group Work is how best to transmit the recommendations of these groups to institutions capable of moving the process forward.

Also, the strategies identified in the Action Steps will need to have a body or organisation to oversee their implementation. The suggestion is that this could be done by CHRAJ pending the identification of another oversight body.

5 Closing Ceremony

After brief remarks from the Commissioner for Human Rights and Administrative Justice, the workshop ended with closing remarks by Hon Nii Okaija Adamafo, Minister of the Interior. Mrs. Betty Mould-Iddrisu delivered the vote of thanks.

5.1 Closing Remarks - Hon. Nii Okaija ADAMAFIO - Minister for the Interior

In the early days of the 31st December Revolution, it was believed perhaps naively, that corruption could be eradicated from Ghanaian society by recourse to very extreme measures. Long imprisonment terms by Public Tribunals and measures including dismissals from office and the confiscation of assets were widespread in those days. The effect of those severe measures was that many Ghanaians began to express misgivings about the use of such drastic methods to deal with the problem of corruption in particular and crime generally in our society. It was even argued that some form of "reconciliation" must be made with those who had been punished by giving back their assets, and sometimes re-instating them in their jobs, because it was conceived that they had been unjustly punished.

Today, we are confronted with the fact that corruption has crept back to the point where it has become an issue and a national one at that. Unfortunately, the issue has tended to become politicised in the climate of multi-partisan democracy, with some anti-Government elements seeking to portray the issue of corruption as laying within the domain of

Government and being the fault of Government officials only.

If this forum should be useful in contributing to the finding of solutions to the problem of corruption in the Ghanaian Society, then your discussions must not have been aimed at point-scoring but, rather, at identifying the broad issues that can unite us all as a people in our determination to tackle the canker of corruption.

We cannot say we will succeed in, altogether, eliminating corruption from our society but we can make it relatively rare.

The first step is to define the scope and content of the problem, against the background of our socio-political and cultural norms and practices.

The next step is to de-politicise the issue.

A third step is to strengthen the institutional capabilities that our Constitution and our laws provide, always remembering that those of us who breach the law must bear the full and natural consequences of our conscious acts.

But whilst institutions and legal measures, etc. can help, we need a general change in the morality of each individual if corruption is to be contained.

Everyone of us has this responsibility - the person who gives a bribe, the person who accepts a bribe, the person who silently looks on are all responsible.

If the workshop is a success in that it has

raised public awareness, some of the areas that have been addressed in the course of your deliberations are no doubt:

- a. General anti-corruption strategies;
- b. Assessment of the strengths and weaknesses of existing anti-corruption agencies and how to strengthen them;
- c. Measures to promote a sustained public awareness campaign;
- d. Role of the Judiciary;

- e. Active media participation, among other things

This Government has demonstrated abundantly its will to fight corruption. Indeed, as recently as last August, Government directed that as part of measures to combat perceptions of corruption in the country, value for money assessments should be the standard procedure in respect of all contract awards. It directed further that technical assessments for the award of contracts should be undertaken in conformity with internationally accepted practices.

The National Integrity Workshop is now declared formally closed.

APPENDIX 1 - MEMBERS OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE

- | | | |
|-----|--------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. | Justice Emile Francis Short | CHRAJ (Chair) |
| 2. | Dr Angela Ofori-Atta | University of Ghana Medical School |
| 3. | Rt. Rev. Charles Palmer-Buckle | Catholic Bishop of Koforidua |
| 4. | Alhaji Futah | Head of the Federation of Muslim
Councils Executive Member and
Advisor to the National Chief Imam |
| 5. | Mr Kwasi Abeasi | Director General, Private Enterprise
Foundation |
| 6. | Mrs Gifty Afenyi-Dadzie | President, Ghana Journalist Association |
| 7. | Mr William Nyarko | Ghanaian Chronicle |
| 8. | Mr Yaw Asamoah | General Law Group, Private |
| 9. | Ms Dorothy K. Gordon | Development Consultant |
| 10. | Prof E. Gyimah-Boadi | Dept of Political Science, Legon |
| 11. | Mrs. Betty Mould Iddrisu | Attorney General's Office |
| 12. | Mr. Osafo Sampong | Attorney General's Office |
| 13. | Ms. Audrey Gadzekpo | School of Communication Studies, Legon |

APPENDIX 2 - WORKSHOP PROGRAMME

DAY ONE: TUESDAY, OCTOBER 20, 1998

- Registration 8.00-8.45 a.m.
- Arrival of Dignitaries 8.30-9.00 a.m.
- Opening Prayers by *Mrs. Abena Manful*
- Introduction of Chair by *Mrs. Angelina Domakyaareh* 9.00-9.05 a.m.
- Introductory remarks by *Mr. Francis Emile Short* 9.05-9.30 a.m.
Commissioner, CHRAJ
- Statement by *Bertrand de Speville*, former Chairman of 9.30-10.00a.m
the Independent Commission Against Corruption,
Hong Kong
- Keynote Address: *Prof. J.E.A. Mills* 10.00-10.30a.m
His Excellency (The Vice- President)
- Remarks by Chair: *Nana (Dr) S.K.B. Asante*, 10.30-10.40 a.m.
Chair, Public Utilities Regulatory Commission
- Performance by *K. Sintim Misa* 10.40-11.00a.m.
- Coffee Break 11.00-11.30a.m.*
- Plenary Session
(Presentations - 10-15 minutes each; Discussions - 30 minutes per topic)
- Topics
- a. Corruption and the Human Factor
Rt. Rev. Charles Palmer Buckle 11.30-11.45a.m.
- b. Combating Corruption in Ghana: A Historical Perspective and
Review of Existing Machinery
aw Asamoah/E.Gyimah-Boadi 11.45-12.00 p.m.
- c. Investigative Journalism: Role Challenges
William Nyarko 12.00-12.15 p.m.

Discussion 45 minutes 12.15-1.00 p.m.
- Lunch 1:00-2:00 p.m.*
- d. Corruption and Private Sector
Kwesi Abeasi 2:00-2:15 p.m.

- e. The Procurement Process
Mr. David Ofosu-Dorte 2:15-2:30 p.m.
- f. The Costs and Consequences of Corruption in the Delivery of Health Care and Education Service
Ms. Audrey Gadzekpo and Dr. Angela Ofori-Atta 2:30-2:45 p.m.
Discussion 45 minutes 2:45-3:30 p.m.
- Coffee Break* 3:30-4:00 p.m.
- Presentation on “Combating Corruption Through Institutional Reform”
Nihal Jayawickrama, (Executive Director, TI) 4:00-4:30 p.m.
Discussion 45 minutes 4:30-5:15 p.m.

DAY TWO: WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 21, 1998

- Presentation on “Botswana’s Approach to Corruption”
Adolph Hirschfeld, (Assistant Director - Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime.) 9:00-9:15 a.m.
Discussion 30 minutes 9:15-9:45 a.m.
Coffee Break 9:45-10:00 a.m.

● Breakout sessions: 10:00-2:00 p.m.
Breakout sessions (10-12) in each group, comprising representatives from different branches of Government and departments, public agencies, and civil society to be serviced by a rapporteur-general. The rapporteur-general will provide a list of questions and guidelines for the group discussions. Each group will have a leader who will take responsibility for preparing the group report.

Themes:

- Group 1 : Constitutional and Legal Anti-Corruption Mechanisms
- Group 2 : Institutional reforms in key institutions (the case of CEPS and the Lands Commission)
- Group 3 : The Role of Civil Society in Combating Corruption
- Group 4 : Towards Eliminating Corruption in the Health and Education Sectors
- Group 5 : The Role of the Media in Combating Corruption
- Group 6 : Corruption and the Procurement Process

Lunch 2:00-3:00 p.m

- Presentation of Syndicate Group Reports 3:00-3:30 p.m.
- Discussion of Syndicate Group Reports 3:30-4:00 p.m.
- Performance by Jimmy Beckley/ Coffee Break 4:00-4:30 p.m.
- Adoption of Action Plans and Follow-up Strategies 4:30-5:00 p.m.
- Closing Ceremony by *Hon. Nii Okaija Adamafo* 5:00p.m
Minister of Interior

APPENDIX 3 - LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Name	Department/Institution
Ebow Quarshie	Ghana Bar Association
Mariam A. Tackie(Mrs)	National Council for Women and Development
Leonora Kyerematen	FIDA
Frank Owusu-Ansah	SRC-Univ. of Ghana
J.E. Quarshie	Ministry of Local Govt. & Rural Development
I.O. Yeboah	Right of the Child Foundation
P.O. Appiah	Attorney General's Office
Benedict Assorow	UNDA-AFRICA
Mrs. E.A. William	Retired Educationist
Charles Ankomah	G.P.R.T.U. of T.U.C
Gifty Afenyi Dadzie	G.J.A.
O.K. Garr	C.H.R.A.J.
F.C. Gyabaah	W.A.E.C.
J. Amanor	Min. of Interior
Mr. Opoku-Boamah	C.E.P.S
Dr. A.L. Ofori-Atta	U.G.M.S
Sqd. Ldr. MM Danquah	AFHQ, Burma Camp
Nana Apt	CSPS UG, Legon
David Ofosu-Dorte	General Law Group
J.S. Sai	Survey Dept
Baffour Anning	AHRH
Abigail Kwash	Min. of Works & Housing
Wisdom Mensah	International Needs Ghana
Togbe Degenu III	Serious Fraud Office
Lt. Col C. Necku	Min. of Education
Kwesi Quartey	Min. of Foreign Affairs
A.C. Coleman	T.U.C.
Alice D. Asare	Ghana Registered Nurses Association
Charles Palmer-Buckle	Catholic Bishop

Name	Department/Institution
Rev. John E. Ackeify	Methodist Church
Charles Asembri	C.E.P.S.
A.K. Mensah	Public Rec & Archives
Maulvi A. Wahab Adam	Ahmadiyya Muslim Mission
Nathaniel Otoo	Gh. Export Prom. Council
R.W. Thompson	Survey Dept
Jay Saidy	TI-GAMBIA
Nana Akua Anyidoho	Rapporteur
Mrs. Gertrude Yartey	Rapporteur
Dolly Acolatse	Rapporteur
Marilyn Aniwee	Rapporteur
Gilbert Tietaah	Rapporteur
Natalie Gordon-Sy	SOS HGIC
Leonora Buckman	Reporter
S.S.Nee-Okpey	National Media Comm
Kojo Moshoeshoe	Ghana Red Cross
B.K. Oppong	C.H.R.A.J
Eben Adama	GIP
Abeiku Sagoe	N.C.C.E
Rt Rev. Justice Akrofi	Christian Council of Ghana
Dorothy K. Gordon	Member of Planning Comm
Francis Emile Short	Member of Planning Comm
Dr. Ken Attafuah	Director of Operations, CHRAJ
Duke Hammond	CHRAJ
E.C. Bondzie	CHRAJ
Abena Manful	CHRAJ
Bosompem Kwame	CIVITAS GH
Angelina M. Domakyaareh	CHRAJ
A. Tetteh Mensah	Serious Fraud Office
Prof. P.A. Twumasi	Office of President
E.L. Otoo	W.A.E.C.

Name	Department/Institution
T.L. Ogum	CHRAJ
T.Q. Nartey	G.B.C
Rev. Fr. Anthony Kornu	National Catholic Secretariat
Kofi Nsake	State Protocol
Betty Mould-Iddrisu	Min. of Justice
Alberta Quartey	G.N.C.C.
Kingsley Rockie	Gh. U.N. Association
Isaac Thompson	JSA Consultants Ltd
E. Gyimah Boadi	CDD/Legon
Rex Owusu-Ansah	Parliament
E. K Bodai	CHRAJ HQS
Audrey Gadzekpo	University of Ghana
E.K. Gbedemah	G.P.R.T.U. of TUC
S. Laryea	W.P.G.
N/Capt. Drapson	Office of the Vice President
Kwasi Abeasi	Private Enterprise Foundation
Joe Appiah	Transparent International
Emmanuel Amofa	SKB Associates
William Boafo	GBA
Comfort Tetteh	UNDP
Bartholomew Arnah	IEA
Chris Dadzie	CHRAJ
William Nyarko	Chronicle
Yaw Asamoah	General Law Group
Beatrice Duncan	SAPRI
Emma Helen Banga	Ghana Registered Nurses Association
Rev. J.A.Morrison	University College Winneba
Mary M. Mensah	CEPS
Joe Effah-Broni	BNI
Victor Hackman	BNI
Yaw Akraasi Sarpong	Private Consultant

Name	Department/Institution
Theo A. Codjoe	Serious Fraud Office
A.N. Chester	Observer
Gershua Jerry Agbo	PAC
Dan. D. Afropong	CHRAJ
Akua Amoah	CHRAJ
Augustina Quayson	Min. of Trades and Industry
Bernard V. Lartey	CEDEP
Emelia Oguah	African Centre for Hum Dev.
Edith Haizel	31st D.W.M.
Naana Mettle-Nunoo	31st D.W.M.
Amponsah Ababio	Ghana Institute of Engineers
Frederick Adu-Nyako	Ghana Institute of Engineers
Emmanuel Aidoo	Academy of Business Administration
Syms Simon	Castle – Osu
Rev. Nicholas Andoh	The New Church
Clement Ofori	Ghana Commission on Dem. & Human Rights
Paapa Nketsiah	NCCE
Theophilus Gokah	GBC
George Lawson	GBC
Gideon Attipoe	GBC Radio News
Francis Tuffour	Catholic Standard
John Kumado	Catholic Standard
Zakaria Musah Tanko	Ghanaian Palaver
Nat S. Acheampong	Ghanaian Democrat
Fred Ogbamey	Ghanaian Chronicle
Husseini Yusetau	Radio Universe
Richelyna Hall	CDD
Nathan Yendi	Free Lands
Vincent Asiseh	NDC
Prof. M. M. Owusu Ansah	Gh Comm for Dem. Hum. Rights
Mercy Ateiku	C.S.P.S. Legon

Name	Department/Institution
<p>Kofi Arthur</p> <p>Marilyn David</p> <p>Mohammed Tahiru A. Muuw</p> <p>Rev. Fr. Bonaventure Quaidoo</p> <p>Christiana Gockel</p> <p>Kofi Ahiabor</p> <p>Mavis Ahenkorah</p> <p>Rev. Ben Anom</p> <p>E.N. Doku</p> <p>Clement Ofori</p> <p>Nana Yaw Asante</p> <p>Kofi Larweh</p> <p>Christopha Kudzadzi</p> <p>Yaw Akraasi Sarpong</p> <p>Adolf Williams</p> <p>Barzini Tanoh</p>	<p>Public Agenda</p> <p>Public Relations</p> <p>Independent</p> <p>Roman Cath. Church</p> <p>Min. of Lands & Forestry</p> <p>Judicial Service</p> <p>CHRAJ</p> <p>Charismatic Church</p> <p>CEPS</p> <p>CIGADS</p> <p>Foundation for Future Leaders</p> <p>Radio Ada</p> <p>Ghana Review Int.</p> <p>N.I.R.P.</p> <p>Ovation Magazine, London</p> <p>WORLDSPACE</p>

APPENDIX 4 - SYNDICATE GROUPS LIST

Group 1: Constitutional and Legal Mechanisms for Combating Corruption

Rapporteur: Ken Attafuah

NAME	INSTITUTION
Mr. William Boafo (Chair)	Ghana Bar Association (Vice-President)
Ms. Abena Manful	CHRAJ
Betrand de Speville	International guest
Adolf Hirschfeld	International guest
Yaw Asamoah	General Law Group
Opoku Quartey	CHRAJ

Group 2: Review of Institutional Reform in two Key Institutions:

1. C.E.P.S.
2. The Lands Commission

Rapporteur: Dolly Acolatse

NAME	INSTITUTION
Ebow Quarshie (Chair)	G.B.A.
Victor Hackman	Office Of the President
M. .M. Mensah	C.E.P.S.
R.W. Thompson	Survey Dept
Major M. M. Danquah (Rtd)	AFHQ
Nana Araba Apt	Centre for Social Policy Studies
M. Opoku-Boamah	C.E.P.S.
Christiana Gockel	Ministry of Lands & Forestry
E.N. Doku	C.E.P.S.
Dr. Charles Asembri	C.E.P.S.

Group 3: Role of Civil Society in Combating Corruption

Rapporteur: Nana Akua Anyidaho

NAME	INSTITUTION
A.K. Mensah	Public Records & Archives
Rt. Rev. Palmer Buckle	Catholic Church
Nii Kate Quartey	Ghana Legal Aid Board
Emmanuel Kofi Aidoo	Admin Academy
Gershon Jerry Agbo	Leg. Res. Off.-Parliament Hs
Frank Owusu-Ansah	University of Ghana - SRC
Kwame Bosompem	Civitas Ghana
Wisdom Mensah	Int. Needs Gh.
Abigail Kwashi	Ministry of Works & Housing
A.K. Mensah	PRAAD
E.S. Sai	Survey Department
Baffour Anning	African Human Rights Heritage
Naana Mettle-Nunoo	31st D.W.M.
Edith Haizel	31st D.W.M.
Bernard V. Lartey	CEDEP
Nana Yaw Asante	F.F.F.L.
Angela Lamensdorf Ofori Atta	Univ. Of Gh.
E. Gyimah Boadi	C.D.D.
Elizabeth Acquah	ASAWA
E. Kweenu Boadi	CHRAJ
Leonora Kyerematen	FIDA
Yaw Akrasi Sarpong	Ethno Botany Consults
Prof. M. M. Owusu-Ansah	Gh. C.D.H.R
Clement Ofori	C.I.G.D.S.
Baffour Anning	A.H.R.H.

Group 4: Towards Eliminating Corruption in the Health and Education Sectors

Rapporteur: Gertrude Yartey

NAME	INSTITUTION
Abeiku Sagoe (Chair)	N.C.C.E.
Paapa Nketsiah	N.C.C.E.
Rev. J.A. Morrison	Univ. College, Winneba
Alice Darkoa Asare	G.R.N.A.
Lt. Col. Necku	MOE
Mrs. Ametor William	Rtd Educ. / Politician
Rev. John E. Ackeifi	Methodist Church
Rt. Rev. Justice Akrofi	Christian Council – Anglican
Kofi Ahiabor	Judicial Service
Yaw Amoako	Exploits Foundation
Joseph Wadjoly	Construction Today
Williams Nutakor	Ad Forum
Ben. B. Lassey	<i>The Concord</i>
Nat S. Acheampong	<i>Ghanaian Democrat</i>
Emmanuel Opare Djan	<i>Ghanaian Democrat</i>
Nathaniel Otoo	<i>GEPC</i>
Chris Dadzie	<i>CHRAJ</i>

Group 5: The Role of the Media in Combatting Corruption

Rapporteur: Gilbert Tietaah

NAME	INSTITUTION
Kwesi Biney (Chair)	The Guide
William Nyarko	Ghanaian Chronicle
Effic Sekyi-Aidoo	G.B.C.
Theresa Dogbe	G.B.C.
Benedict Assorow	National Catholic Secretariat
Seth Ney-Okye	Media Commission
Cyril Acolatse	G.B.C.
Cosmos Ampontey Forster	University of Ghana
Gideon Attipoe	G.B.C.
George Lawson	G.B.C.
Jay Saidy	TI - Gambia
Kojo Moshoeshoc	Red Cross (Gh)
S. Laryea	W.P.G.
Kofi Arthur	<i>Public Agenda (Newspaper)</i>
Theophilus Gokah	G.B.C.
Joe Amanor	Ministry of Interior
George M. Naykene	Journalist
Moses Boye Laryea	Univ. Of Ghana (Legon)
Natt Nii Yemoh	Univ. Of Ghana (Legon)
Vincent Asiseh	NDC
John Kumado	Catholic Standard
Patrick Agbo-Klu	G.N.A.
Assuman Bofo Kwasi	The Independence
Husseini Yushau	Radio Universe

Group 6: Corruption and the Procurement Process

NAME	INSTITUTION
David Ofosu-Dorte (Chair)	General Law Group
Rev. Fr. Anthony Kormu	National Catholic Secretariat
Bernard Y. Lartey	CEDEP
Emml. O. Bondzie	CHRAJ
Duke Hammond	CHRAJ
I.O. Yeboah	G.E.S.
Rev. Fr. Bernadentine Quaidoo	Catholic Church (Damongo Ch)
Togbe Degbenu	Serious Fraud Office
Akua Amoah (Mrs)	CHRAJ
Annin Eric	CDD
Kofi Amasah	Press
Emma H. Banga (Mrs)	Ghana Registered Nurses Assoc.

DESIGN AND PRINTING BY WADSO,
TEL: 760669 / 760467 / FAX: 760670